DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 081 548 56 RC 007 257

AUTHOR Payne, I. V.; Medina, Edward
TITLE Educational Accomplishment Audit Report, FY 1971-72. [Southeastern New Mexico Bilingual Education Program.]
INSTITUTION Artesia Public Schools, N. Mex.
SPONS AGENCY Bureau of Elementary and Secondary Education (DHEW/OE), Washington, D.C. Div. of Bilingual Education.
PUB DATE 72
GRANT OEG-0-9-410028-3443(280)
NOTE 19p.

EDRS PRICE MF-$0.65 HC-$3.29
DESCRIPTORS *Bilingual Education; *Comparative Analysis; Educational Improvement; *Evaluation Criteria; Minority Group Children; Program Effectiveness; *Program Evaluation; *Spanish Speaking
IDENTIFIERS *Southeastern New Mexico Bilingual Program

ABSTRACT

The audit report (1971-72) on the Southeastern New Mexico Bilingual Education Program, under the sponsorship of the Artesia Public Schools, critiques the project evaluation with notations on comparative findings of the evaluation and audit. The report is divided into 4 sections: (1) introductory and general comments on project evaluation quality and the comparative findings of the project evaluation and the audit; (2) detailed critique of the comprehensive evaluation based on instruments used, data collection, data analysis, and data analysis presentation; (3) description of the auditor's on-site findings and their correlation with the evaluator's data and reports on a component-by-component basis, and a summary of consistencies and discrepancies; (4) recommendations for evaluation design revisions with a rationale for each; and (5) confirmation or questioning of the need for program modifications proposed in the project evaluation. (Author/NQ)

ED 081548

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, EDUCATION & WELFARE
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION
THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY

EDUCATIONAL ACCOMPLISHMENT AUDIT REPORT
FY 1971-72

This audit report on the Southeastern New Mexico Bilingual Education Program (OEG-0-9-410028-3443-(280)) is made in compliance with the contractual agreement, legal prescriptions, and official directives under the provisions of Title VII of Public Law 89-10, as amended, for the establishment of bilingual education programs. The program is funded through the Artesia (New Mexico) School District with Bill Gutierrez as Program Director.

The audit report as submitted herein, is a critique concerning the project evaluation with notations on comparative findings of the project evaluation and the audit as related to the performance and process objectives identified in the evaluation design instrument. The auditor, in this report, will confirm or question the need for program modifications which have been proposed as a result of the project evaluation and onsite observations and visitations.

Scope of the Audit Report

The audit report follows rather closely the Suggested Audit Report Content Areas received from the United States Office of Education and made a part of the contractual agreement between the auditor and the program director, as follows:

1. Introductory and general comments concerning the quality of the project evaluation and the comparative findings of the project evaluation and the audit.
2. Detailed critique of the comprehensive evaluation conducted, by component, based on an assessment of the instruments used, data collection, data analysis, and the manner in which data analysis is presented.
3. Description of the audit contractor's on-site visit findings and their correlation with the Project Evaluator's data and reports on a component by component basis; summary of consistencies and discrepancies.
4. Recommendations for revisions in the evaluation design, including a rationale for each recommendation. Since the auditor's objectivity can be retained only if the selection of a specific corrective action is a local

FILMED FROM BEST AVAILABLE COPY

RC 007257

decision, the audit contractor will provide general rather than specific recommendations, posing several alternative actions or possible sources of assistance to the Project in correcting the deficiency.

5. Confirmation or questioning of the need for program modifications which have been proposed as a result of Project evaluation.

Each of the audit areas described above will be referred to as sections with section numbers agreeing with the audit description number.

SECTION I - INTRODUCTORY AND GENERAL COMMENTS

The Southeastern New Mexico Bilingual Program, OEG-0-9-410028-3445-(280), is under the sponsorship of the Artesia (New Mexico) Public Schools through the Educational Services Center. The Project is under the leadership and supervision of the Project Director and other available specialists from within the school system.

Six public school districts (Artesia, Carlsbad, Roswell, Lake Arthur, Hagerman, and Dexter) with supplementary help from Eastern New Mexico University-Roswell Campus and the New Mexico State Department of Education have cooperated to implement the Bilingual Program in the Lower Pecos Valley of New Mexico. The cooperating schools are participating in the planned program on a daily basis for a period of nine(9) months. Artesia is in the third year development phase while subsequent diversification is in the second year development phase in the remaining communities.

Each classroom component operates within the regular hours of the respective elementary school. All classes participating in the project are housed in regular classrooms within the confines of an elementary school plant. In all components where monolingual laboratory teacher is involved, bilingual sessions are provided within the morning schedule because the teacher aide assigned to each classroom being serviced works in the classroom only in the morning.

The effectiveness of an evaluation is primarily

determined by how well the evaluating techniques quantify through objective measurements the quality and extent of pupil learning for which the project is chiefly responsible. After careful examination of the evaluation design, techniques employed in the evaluation, procedures followed, and purusual of the written evaluation report it can be concluded that the major objective has been to measure learning outcomes and the progress in learning. The evaluation, although concerned with inputs, has concentrated its evaluative judgments on outputs--progress toward achievement of stated project objectives.

Standardized instruments, uniformly applied to experimental (project participants) groups and control groups have been utilized for objective measurements. Baseline references and data have been followed in reporting group accomplishment. The instruments used were selected because of their generally high acceptance as standardized measuring devices and high validity in normal applications. Analysis of test results have been divided into four groups:

1. Dominant Spanish speaking children in the bilingual components.
2. Non-Dominant Spanish speaking children in the bilingual component.
3. Dominant Spanish speaking children in the laboratory component.
4. Non-Dominant Spanish speaking children in the laboratory component.

Informal assessment based on observations, teacher made measuring instruments, and student performance were utilized to provide feedback during the teaching-learning process as instruments (or processes) for Project evaluation purposes. Criterion referenced tests for evaluation purposes received only minimal use.

The evaluation design, procedures, and techniques have emerged as the program has developed. Conferences between the Project Director, the Evaluator, and the Auditors throughout the year have been effective in (a) creating channels of communication for better understandings and (b)

elimination of irrelevant procedures and the refinement of instruments to better assess the level, or degree, of accomplishment of program objectives.

The utilization of the Stanford Achievement Test at the first grade level does not provide a pre-test baseline since it is not applicable for use with children just beginning school. Comparisons of first grade progress has been in relation to a 0.0 assumed baseline for both Project and Control children at the first grade level.

In general, the evaluation was well done and has considerable merit. The evaluation results point to some needed alterations in the program and provide evidence of successful pupil growth in a variety of areas. Analysis of the evaluation report as it relates to successful accomplishment and areas of concern will be dealt with in subsequent sections of this report.

Comments and clarifications made herein and in subsequent recommendations are not intended to lead to any hasty conclusions with regard to the adequacy of the Evaluation Design and Evaluation Procedures as submitted. The evaluation instruments have proven to be generally satisfactory, and the evaluation report at this time is quite adequate. This is especially true when one considers that this is an evaluation of a developing program with few guidelines or precedents upon which to base data interpretation and conclusions. Also, it must be recognized that any attempt to evaluate a bilingual-bicultural program with instruments which have been standardized on the broader population in which the English speaking population represents a strong majority presents some problems that have not yet been adequately resolved.

SECTION II - CRITIQUE OF EVALUATION REPORT

The Evaluation Design. The Evaluation Design was developed to measure the extent to which performance objectives were attained. The design is well organized and meets the basic needs for effective program evaluation.

The Evaluation Instruments. Some difficulty has been experienced in test instruments. As clarified in the Evaluation Report, several of the test instruments are less than totally satisfactory for accomplishing effective measurements of growth toward the achievement of established objectives.

It would seem advisable for the project to consider criterion referenced tests or seek new or additional tests that offer greater utility and validity in testing bilingual children.

Control Groups. Care taken in selection of control groups has assured randomly matched counterparts. Some difficulties occure as "control" families move and tend to deplete the number needed for meaningful comparisons.

Audit of Performance
Objectives Accomplishment

Objective: Dominant Spanish speaking children in the Bilingual Program will learn 5% more of the standard curriculum as compared to dominant Spanish speaking children of comparable age, grade and cultural groups who did not participate in the program.

In comparing first grade bilingual pupil gain with control pupil gain Stanford Achievement Test results show control group to have slightly greater gain in (1) word, paragraph, and vocabulary and (2) word study skills. There was no difference between groups in (3) arithmetic. It follows that the above objective was not accomplished.

The second grade bilingual group, when compared with the control group showed significant gains in all areas tested. The objective of 5 percent gain was reached and extended to 8.36 percent gain.

The third grade bilingual group, when compared with the control group, showed significant gains in all test areas. The 5 percent gain objective was extended to 14.30 percent.

Conclusions: While the first grade groups were very close with the control group having a slight edge, the gains

of second and third grade bilingual groups was well beyond the 5 percent objective.

Objective: Non-Dominant Spanish speaking children in the Bilingual Program will learn 5 percent more of the standard curriculum as compared to Non-Dominant Spanish Speaking children of comparable grade, age, and cultural group who have not participated in the program.

The first grade bilingual and control groups each had only one non-dominant Spanish speaking child. The number is too small for any meaningful analysis.

The second grade bilingual group showed significant gain (16.04%) over the control group in Words, Paragraph, and Vocabulary section of the S.A.T. and 7.84% gain over the control group in Spelling and Word Study Skills.

The third grade bilingual group scored lower than the control group on both sections of the test.

Conclusion: Although there is some evidence in favor of the bilingual group at the second grade and evidence favoring the control group at the third grade level the small number of students involved make it impossible to conclude with any degree of certainty regarding the accomplishment of the objective.

Objective: Non-Dominant Spanish speaking children in Lab Group will score as high as, or higher than, the Non-Dominant Spanish speaking children of comparable grade, age, and cultural group who have not participated in the Program.

The laboratory group showed slight loss over the control group in all phases of the test. However, this is not a realistic comparison because only one child was in this classification of the Program students.

Conclusion: The number sampled is not adequate to arrive at any conclusion regarding the accomplishment of the objective.

Objective: Dominant Spanish speaking children in the Lab Group will learn 5 percent more of the standard curriculum as compared to Dominant Spanish speaking children of

comparable age, grade, and cultural groups who have not participated in the Program.

The control group was slightly ahead of the laboratory group by .27%.

Conclusion: The Program group failed to meet its 5% greater growth objective.

Significant Observation: It is worthy of notation at this point that the test measured I.Q. scores ranged several points difference between the Program students and their counterparts in rooms not involved in the program. This difference consistently favored the control groups. Since this I.Q. difference was greater than 5%, and when taken into account, it is only reasonable to conclude that children in the Program did relatively better than test results show.

Objective: All students in the Program will score higher individually on the Spanish version of the Peabody Picture Vocabulary Test than comparable students (age, grade, and cultural background) not participating in the Program by the following standards: (a) Dominant Spanish speaking students by 5%, (b) Non-Domiant Spanish speaking by 10%. All students in the Program will collectively score higher on the Spanish version of the Peabody Picture Vocabulary Test than comparable students (age, grade, and background) not participating in the Program by the following standards: (a) Dominant Spanish speaking students by 10% and (b) Non-Dominant Spanish speaking students by 12%.

The test scores indicate that Project students at all three grade levels surpassed those in the control group by considerable margins. There were some individual exceptions.

Conclusion: Students in the Program did score higher than the control group by scores sufficiently high to conclude that the objective was successfully achieved.

Objective: Individual comparative scores on the

English version of the Peabody Picture Vocabulary Test between students in the Program and comparable control students will show the following: (a) Dominant Spanish speaking Program students will excell by 5% and (b) Non-Dominant Spanish speaking students will score as high as control group students. Collective comparative scores on the English version for the Peabody Picture Vocabulary Test between students in the Program and comparable control students will show the following: (a) Dominant Spanish speaking Program students will excell by 10% and (b) Non-Dominant Spanish speaking Program students will score as high as control group students.

In individual comparative scores expected goals were reached by 44% of first grade Program students, by 50% of second graders, and by only 7% of third graders. In comparing collective group scores the bilingual dominant Spanish speaking first graders exceeded the control group by 14%, and non-dominant Spanish speaking exceeded the control group by 16%. At the second grade level Program students excelled by 5% and 27%. Third grade Program students excelled by 1% and 5%.

Conclusion: Although the gains by the dominant Spanish speaking Program children in second and third grades failed to meet the objective, all first graders and the non-dominant Spanish speaking Program children met or exceeded the objective.

Objective: All students in the Program will have a 5% better self-image than control students of comparable age, grade, and cultural group not in the Program as measured by a self-image scale.

All Program groups showed positive gains on the self-image test while all control groups showed a loss in self-image ranging from a loss of 5.3% to 17.1%.

Conclusion: The first and second grade groups showed 9.8% and 6.6% gain respectively while the control groups showed 5.3% and 17.1% losses. The third grade Program group showed only .07% gain while its counterpart showed an 11% loss. It must be concluded that the objective was reached

and exceeded.

General Audit Observations

From records in the Project Director's office and at other locations throughout the Program locations the auditor was able to ascertain the following:

1. A well planned, scheduled, and conducted series of field trips made it possible for the students to visit a number of worthwhile areas and activities in the community area.

2. Five inservice workshops on a variety of relevant topics were held. These were generally all-day sessions and were exceptionally well attended. The auditor had occasion to observe participants at two of these inservice sessions and must conclude that participant interest was exceptionally high.

3. Mr. Albino Baca, formerly a teacher in the bilingual Program, was moved to the assignment of Curriculum Specialist for the Program. One of his major responsiblilites was to supervise the production of instructional materials. The Program has developed and printed a number of books and other materials. These include a remembrance story collection, adventrue stories, stories by students, and an ecological book. Several books have workbooks and teacher manuals. A curriculum guide for bilingual education, although not yet completed, shows consideralbe progress and much potential. It should be helpful to those involved in the Program and may well serve as a model for other schools to use.

4. One of the strong features of the project has been the close home-school-community coordination. This has come about because of the interest of all participants in the project with special emphasis and effort provided by the Home Coordinator. The Home Coordinator has maintained a comprehensive daily log of activities. Mrs. Anna Almanza has worked most actively and aggressively in relating the project to the home and involving the parents in school activities. She has assisted teachers and aides in furthering school-home relationships. She has worked effectively with individuals, organizations, and town groups. A great deal of counselling with parents regarding their children and school progress has helped further the home's appreciation for, and interest in, the bilingual Program.

5. The college program for paraprofessionals has operated in a successful manner. Following is a summary of the training component of the Program. College courses offered through ENMU-Roswell Branch were conducted regularly at Lomita School in Artesia. Courses offered were in keeping with the aides' degree plans. Analysis of the final grades for the Fall Semester and Mid-term grades for the Spring Semester indicates the aides were satisfactorily applying themselves and the collective

grade-point each semester was well above a 2. on the 4 point system. Fall final grades: A-23, B-33, C-26, and F-8. Spring mid-term grades: A-12, B-47, C-37, D-7, and F-1. Staff members were well qualified, experienced teachers. Degree Plans for all participants have been properly prepared.

6. The Advisory Council held six meetings during the year with attendance ranging from 10 to 26 members. Meetings, for the most part, were of dual purpose: (1) to keep the committee informed regarding the progress of the Program and (2) to provide inservice-type training regarding bilingual education. The agendas were well planned and minutes were properly written following each meeting.

7. A suggested curriculum guideline has been developed. It contains recommended daily time allotments. The course content and suggested strategies has been included for: Bi-culturalism in the Bi-lingual School, Spanish Materials, Spanish Concepts and Objectives, Bilingual Mathematics, English as a Second Language, Language Arts in the Bilingual Program, Language Arts Concepts and Objectives, Ciencias 1971-72, Seguridad Bilingual 1971-72, and Bilingual Health.

8. Purchase orders showed that $8540 was allocated to the Bilingual Program from the state school enrichment fund. The systematic record keeping system maintained separate records for purchases made from this special account. An equipment inventory is maintained. The inventory shows the quantity, location, value, and person responsible for each inventoried item. Where appropriate serial numbers and/or other identification is included. The latest inventory is dated January, 1972. A new inventory was to be taken at the close of the current school year. Purchase orders for supplies, materials, equipment, and books are maintained in the office of the project director.

SECTION III - AUDITORS' ON-SITE VISITATION

During the course of the 1971-72 fiscal year the auditing team spent a total of 14 man-days in on-site visitation. Interim reports were submitted earlier. The following is a report of visitations near the end of the teaching year.

The specific purposes of the on-site visitation were (1) to assess the role and input of Artesia Public School Administration in the Title VII Program, (2) to determine whether the teacher aide training program objectives were being accomplished, (3) to observe whether teachers were making better use of their aides, a weakness identified

during earlier visits, and (4) to study raw data and other pertinent information related to the evaluation of the Program.

Administration of the Program. The Project Director and the Curriculum Specialist have formed a very effective team of bilingual educators which has given a realistic and educationally sound meaning, understood by all participants, to the philosophy of bilingual education and to the content of of its curriculum.

On-site visits to the various centers located in Artesia, Carlsbad, Roswell and Lake Arthur have served to establish that the respective principals, with perhaps one exception, are most cooperative and know the WHY of the Program. The Project Director and Curriculum Specialist are consulted by the Principals in matters relating to personnel, parent involvement, and pupil participation involved in all facets of the project. It was found that most teachers and teacher-aides were very enthusiastic about the entire bilingual activity and well-informed as to the HOW of implementing the curriculum. The school community has come to endorse, accept and understand the bilingual program as is currently being administered by the Artesia Public Schools.

The Southeastern New Mexico Bilingual Program personnel continue to express a willingness to work in modifying and adapting the curriculum content to meet the individual educational needs of children attending the various elementary schools within the latter's broad goals and concepts. School Administrators (Superintendents, Principals, Curriculum Coordinators, etc.) should continue to work toward developing viable working relationships with all those assigned to work in the bilingual program so as to enhance an effective educational experience for the children involved and to irradicate the myth that Spanish surname children enrolled in these early grades are identical robots rather than children which are indeed different human beings, with emotions and feelings, deserving of an opportunity to succeed. It is hoped, therefore, that all staff members not presently involved in the bilingual program accept it as an integral part of the total

school goals and concepts rather than as something "special" and without continuity.

Recuritment and assignment of pupils as participants in the bilingual program should involve more concerned people. It is difficult to determine and interpret the criteria used for recruitment and assignment of pupils at some centers when viewed in light of children in the program.

Teacher-Aide Training Program. The Grant Package Proposal for FY 1971-72 included an ambitious, but realistic, program for the para-professional training component of the project. Although the College of Artesia had been the main Center for college training of para-professional project participants, its closing caused a temporary halt to the course work plans. However, an agreement was reached with Eastern New Mexico University-Roswell Campus to continue the training of the para-professionals. At the present time ENMU-Roswell Campus does offer to para-professionals a program of studies design which will enable the participants to eventually acquire a Bachelor of Arts Degree in elementary education with a major in the teaching of ethnic groups and a minor in Spanish. Some thirty participants are taking advantage of this opportunity. Although the latter will be explained in more detail in the proposal for continuation of the Program for FY 1972-73 it is cited in this report, not because it is another program for another degree, but because it is an example of how innovative programs can be developed when the efforts of colleges and public schools work closely together. Cultural Anthropology, Ethnology of the Southwest, Selected Topics in Spanish (a beginning field course in Bilingual Instruction), Hispanic Culture and Civilization, and all levels of Spanish courses are but a few of the prescribed offerings. It is the feeling of the auditing team that the pre-service and in-service training programs as implemented have provided the participants with a vast and useful body of knowledge regarding modern theories of human growth and development and a realistic philosophy of education. We agree with the Project Director when he states

that "the teacher-aide training component of the project has offered stability and scope toward the gradual training of Bilingual teachers to fill the vast needs of Southeastern New Mexico." Another significant strength of the prescribed training component (preservice and in-service) is that although methods for implementation of the curriculum are a basic part of the agenda, it is child-oriented when one studies the content and guidelines offered to the participants. Parents, teachers, teacher-aides and pupils are involved in the planning. The input provided in this manner is valued by both the Project Director and the Curriculum Specialist. Incidentally, the latter two professionals go about their business with dedication and not with assumed superiority as two "generales" of a militaristic extravaganza. Their sincere dedication serves as a model for other participants in the program.

Teacher Use of Teacher-Aides. This component of the program appears to need more emphasis during FY 1972-73. It does not mean, however, that it has been identified as a major weakness of the program. It is a major component of any effective bilingual-bicultural program. If the teacher-aide is to function as a second voice for a monolinual teacher by assisting with the Spanish instructional reinforcement, the implications of importance are obvious.

At several of the centers visited teachers were hesitant to allow the teacher-aide to assume the instruction of the related curriculum in Spanish but chose to have her performing English-oriented activities as "correcting," "checking," "spelling," and building "exhibits." It should he stressed to all participating teachers that their aides are part of the teaching team and that planning for the day's activities is indeed a cooperative enterprise involving both. Significant improvements were noticed in the follow-up visit. However, more needs to be done if teacher aides are to become really useful tools for instruction in a bilingual aura rather than as a crutch in an antiseptic teaching exercise.

The Evaluation. Although numerous problems arose during the evaluation process cooperative efforts and sincere interest in the program made it possible to meet all obstacles with satisfactory alternative solutions. The evaluation report as submitted has been thoroughly critiqued elsewhere. Suffice it here to merely comment that the evaluation was done in a very professional manner and presented with as much objectivity as was possible. There was no evidence of any attempt to whitewash any phase of the program. On several occasions explanations were made regarding some testing results. These appear to be logical explanations and such conclusions were arrived at only after very thoughtful consideration.

Conclusion. The auditing experience, particularly the on-site visitation, has been a most pleasant one. The courtesies extended by all of the Bilingual Program staff and school administrators are indeed appreciated and most gratifying. The auditing team sincerely submits that the Southeastern Bilingual Program might well serve as a model for this region, as for three years it has dared to be creative, innovative, flexible, and unafraid of publishing the factual results of its effort using as a base its belief that "this program is a vehicle and pedigogical tool to better prepare children to function as successful citizens in a democratic society." It is firmly believed that this program is bringing to Artesia and environs interracial unity and understanding.

SECTION IV - REVISIONS IN EVALUATION DESIGN

Previous Evaluation Designs have been designed to be as compatible with the Artesia Public Schools testing and evaluation program as possible. It has been felt that if the bilingual program is to become a regular and vital component of the school curriculum it should incorporate as much of the regular program as feasible. The evaluation design reflects this thinking.

Basically the Evaluation Design has served its function well. It has attempted, and with measurable success, to establish levels of growth in several areas. The Stanford Achievement Tests and the Peabody Picture Vocabulary Test have measured cognitive growth and provided information to compare students with the Artesia school children in general. Self-image scales and teacher judgments help to measure important areas in the affective domain.

The Evaluation Design has been constructed in an organized manner that makes it easy to identify the Project's objectives and the tools to be used for measuring accomplishments in these areas. It is recommended that the structural pattern of the Evaluation Design for 1972-73 remain essentially the same.

It may be desirable to consider some changes in kinds of measuring tools and procedures. It would appear that the bilingual and laboratory components have process goals and purposes so varied from the usual school program that special measuring techniques become necessary.

The formal evaluation has given only small consideration to the teacher's analysis of individual pupil growth. It would appear that this is an important source of evaluative information that has been largely neglected. The auditing team would recommend greater utilization of teacher assessment of individual students.

Criterion referenced examinations (tests), developed at the local project level would focus closer attention to the stated objectives. Locally developed tests would meet two common basic concerns regarding the evaluation process: (1) English oriented and standardized tests reflect a bias that is disadvantageous to the dominant Spanish speaking child and (2) Available tests do not adequately measure all of the planned growth changes deemed important in the bilingual education program.

Teacher developed measuring devices would be another level of the materials development component of the project. These might be directly related to the special materials

being developed by the project as well as other materials and experiences provided through the project.

The suggestions made here are not to be interpreted as favoring elimination of present testing program activities. It is possible that some parts of the present program do measure objectives accomplishment better than other instruments. In this case they should be retained. Criterion based and teacher developed measuring instruments would then be used to supplement the present evaluation process.

SECTION V - NEEDS FOR PROGRAM MODIFICATION

The Southeastern New Mexico Bilingual Program has just completed its third successful year of operation. The program in the Artesia Public Schools has advanced through the third year (grade level) of school.

The successes and weaknesses of the project have been identified through visitations, observations, informal assessments, and the formal evaluation of the project.

On the basis of these opportunities for assessing the program the auditors present the following suggestions:

1. Establish more clearly the differentiation between the bilingual classrooms and the laboratory classrooms in order that the strengths and weaknesses of each might be more clearly identified. This is also suggested as a means of helping school personnel not identified with the program and interested townspeople better understand the program.

2. Establish some framework for analysis of cost-quality relationships of both the bilingual and the laboratory components. These should be developed in such manner that the dollar value of services received can be compared with the pupil cost in the "regular" classroom.

3. Some systematic assessment should be made to compare the "departmentalized" bilingual classrooms with those that are self-contained.

4. Earlier assessments have shown that students' self-image suffers significantly at the intermediate grade levels.

Serious consideration for extending the bilingual program into the fourth year (grade) with special emphasis being placed on the affective behavioral domain should be a priority item for the Artesia Public Schools.

5. Elementary building principals need to become more actively involved. Ultimately the program will become their responsibility as part of the elementary school program. Every effort should be made to involve them in all inservice activities. Likewise, principals should actively engage in future project planning.

6. The Project Director might consider the possibility of negotiating with one of New Mèxico's colleges to offer an extension course/s in conversational Spanish. This would be primarily for teachers in the project but open to others if they can be accomodated. College credit should be available.

7. Efforts should continue to encourage teachers to plan for, and utilize, teacher aide services more extensively as bilingual adjuncts in the classroom.

8. Time utilization is important in order that both teacher and aide function at peak efficiency. Careful planning should become a part of role expectations for all personnel in the program in order that the best possible utilization of available time and professional talents will be assured.

CONCLUSIONS

The Southeastern New Mexico Bilingual Program has successfully completed its third year of operation. During this time the program has expanded upward and into other cooperating school districts.

Although staffing primary grades with well qualified teachers is becoming increasingly difficult, the Southeastern New Mexico Bilingual Program has successfully met this obstacle and the program has moved forward with no significant interruptions.

Mr. Bill Gutierrez, Project Director, has worked unceasingly toward the accomplishment of project goals. He has exerted positive leadership in involving staff members in planning and program development. Mr. Gutierrez enjoys high respect from his staff, the administration, and the downtown community.

The staff has proven itself to be dedicated and anxious to develop the best possible bilingual program to serve the youth throughout the Lower Pecos Valley. The members of the staff have supported such project activities as inservice training, program development, community involvement, and materials development.

Although project evaluation presented some problems at times, it has been successfully completed and presented in a report that is readily understood. The report is accurate, frank, and to the point. Some areas failed to measure as strongly in the evalution process as aimed for in the objective. Yet, generally speaking the project has demonstrated success. Although no apology is needed, explanation is presented regarding the relatively low measured I.Q.'s of project students when compared to other comparable groups.

The project auditors have been well received by project staff members and administrators of all schools cooperating in the project. Records, reports, and materials were always available when needed.

The Southeastern New Mexico Bilingual Project and its staff are to be commended for providing a forward thrust program which is contributing to the educational breakthrough for effective education for the dominant Spanish speaking child in the southwest.

Respectfully submitted:

I. V. Payne, Chief Auditor

Edward Medina, Auditor
June 39, 1972